

SOCIALISATION AND INSTITUTIONALISATION PROCESS OF THE MODERATE RELIGIOUS CULTURE IN INDONESIAN *MADRASAH*S

NUR KAFID

Department of Islamic Political Thought, Faculty of Ushuluddin and Da'wah, Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Mas Said Surakarta, Indonesia

Email: nur.kafid@staff.uinsaid.ac.id

ZULKIFLI

Department of Sociology, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Indonesia
Email: zulkifli@uinjkt.ac.id

MUHAMMAD FAIQ

Department of Aqidah and Islamic Philosophy, Faculty of Ushuluddin and Humanities Universitas Islam Negeri Walisongo Semarang, Indonesia

Email: faiq_muhammad@walisongo.ac.id

Received on: 02-02-23

Accepted on: 19-02-25

<https://doi.org/10.57144/hi.v48i1.743>

Abstract

The potential for being intolerant, radical, or even extreme is more common in public schools than in *madrasahs* (Islamic schools). However, religious moderation practices in *madrasahs* have not been able to dominate public space. This study aims to analyse and disclose the process of socialisation and institutionalisation of moderate religious culture in Indonesian *madrasahs*. This paper is an ethnographic study of the *madrasahs* (Islamic senior high schools) in Solo, Central Java, with an interpretive-constructivist approach. The data were collected from in-depth interviews and field observations with 105 respondents, including *madrasah* principals, teaching staff, and students who were selected purposively. Three processes of reduction, interpretation, and conclusion are applied for data analysis. The results revealed that the socialisation and institutionalisation process in *madrasahs* had

succeeded in instilling moderate religious culture among students. Students understood the concept of religious moderation very well, i.e. being in the middle position, meaning not too extreme whether left or right. However, it is understood only in terms of social relations, not faith ('aqīdah). Besides, the results show that the process has not been oriented towards interreligious and digital literacy and has not led them to make religious moderation a collective action. Students are not actively involved in responding to religious and social diversity issues around them. Moreover, Solo is often accused of being an intolerant city. It is because of students' lack of literacy or comprehensive knowledge regarding the understanding and practice of religious moderation. Then, moderate groups, which are basically dominant, remain silent, so they prefer to act permissively toward intolerant behaviours. Again, the history of religious conflicts in the past has made identity politics increasingly intense in Solo. Lastly, there is an absence of public figures who are supposed to be catalysts for moderate movements. So, the findings suggest massive campaigns against moderate action among students and made them consider its necessity in public spaces, including on social media.

Keywords: *Religious Moderation, Socialisation, Institutionalisation, Student, Indonesian Madrasah*

Introduction

The trend and intensity of Islamic movements in the last two decades have continued to increase with various forms and issues they promote from the national to the local level.¹ The movement has even succeeded in infiltrating and attracting the sympathy of young Indonesian Muslims, especially those who live in urban and suburban areas.² The pattern occurs through online media,³ educational institutions,⁴ and family. The Wahid Foundation's study found a relatively high trend of hate speech among Rohis activists (Rohis or *Rohāni Islam*, a group of Islamic religious activity at senior high school). It is evidenced by the speech material, which leads to utterances of hatred against other religions, the government and even the campaign for choosing friends based on religious background. Ma'arif Institute, PPIM UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta,⁵ and Alvara Research Center found relatively high cases of intolerance and the potential for extreme radicalism among students reflected from the curriculum content, textbooks and teachers' exclusive understanding. SETARA Institute again found quite a high potential for intolerance among students by category: passive/puritan (35.7 percent), active/radical (2.4 percent) and potential terrorist (0.3 percent).⁶ The study by Rohman dan Kafid also found that the seeds of intolerance and radicalism that have developed among

students of Islamic Universities in Indonesia have emerged since they were in high school.

This situation will potentially become a serious challenge in the efforts of consolidating democracy,⁷ social stability, politics and the economy, and the existence of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia (NKRI, Negara Kesatuan Republik Indonesia). It is why the initiative for counter-narrative movements arises, which carries the importance of understanding, attitudes, and religious practices that are friendly, accommodating to local culture, and cooperative towards the presence of the state, including encouraging changes in the model of religious education, from the orientation of exclusive religious attitudes to inclusiveness.⁸ Therefore, students as young generations have a vital position in this regard as they can be a driving force for social change.⁹ The youths are the most active and creative group in society in building identities, reconstructing meanings and symbols from various elements of tradition, and using global influence. They are also more interactive and less hierarchical in social relationships.¹⁰ They can be more educated, open, and mobile, interact and communicate with new people and ideas, and construct their identity based on available cultural material.

In addition, digital media presents a dilemma today, offering both negative and positive effects. Advanced information and communication technology, where digitalisation has become part of a lifestyle and way of thinking, has influenced the model of religious learning among today's young Muslim generations.¹¹ Previously, religious knowledge was obtained directly from authoritative figures such as '*ulama*, *kiai* (an honorific title for Muslim clergy in Indonesia), *ustād* (استاد) (teachers) at pesantren and *madrasahs*. Now, it is replaced by learning through social media.¹² As a result, the possibility of getting misinformation increases. The religious understanding obtained is just symbolic-formalistic, so the youths are more vulnerable to becoming intolerant, radical, and extreme.¹³ Further, mainstream religious moderation among school students, especially *madrasahs*, becomes a challenge.

It is important to note that religious moderation is the internalisation of religious teachings by its adherents and their active role in overcoming conflicts with religious nuances.¹⁴ So, it must not quit at the discourse level. Efforts are needed to contextualise its values to a practical level. The substance of religious teachings is supposed to be reflected in every behaviour of its adherents. Moderation must manifest into an individual's active role in maintaining a balance between religious experience

and respect for other people's religious practices.¹⁵ Moderation as a manner of verbal communication cannot be separated from the speaker's position. It differs from the text, whose position is still attached to the speaker. Therefore, the dynamics and development of moderation will always be intertwined with tradition, power, institutions, and various other modes of knowledge dissemination. At this level, there is potential for the element of 'subjectivity' to enter into the reproduction process of moderation. When moderation is seen as a practice,¹⁶ it must be seen that there is a reciprocal relationship between the actor and the 'objective structure', as the knowledge is passed down from generation to generation in symbolic form or *habitus*. It presupposes that religion is not merely inherited knowledge but also something that is 'constructed' socially.

So far, religious moderation has become an essential part of the Indonesian national development program and the development of Indonesian human resources. *Madrasahs* have received serious attention and are expected to become the leading sector in strengthening religious moderation. Historically, *madrasahs* in Indonesia are considered Islamic educational institutions that are not anti-modernised, accommodate various forms of culture, and have a positive response and support for democracy and tolerance. According to Mumuh Muhtarom,¹⁷ *madrasahs* in Indonesia are the essential instruments for Islamic intellectual revival and an effective means of spreading inclusive Islamic teachings. In other words, *madrasahs* are believed to strengthen social humanism, generate social mobilisation, and have succeeded in shaping Indonesian culture and fostering the concept of the "authentic self," which offers a unique way of building students' character.

Studies show that public schools are prone to intolerance, radicalism, and even extremism compared to *madrasahs*. However, it does not automatically mean that the *madrasahs* environment is more moderate. Likewise, the practice of religious moderation of *madrasahs* students in Solo surprisingly has not been able to dominate public space. Even *madrasahs* tend to be silent or passive when conflicts with religious nuances arise in their surroundings. Solo is a very pluralistic but religious city. However, intolerant acts often occur, such as the destruction of graves of the Christians by the youths in 2021. According to Alexander R. Arifianto,¹⁸ such an attitude may strengthen the trend of intolerance and extremism in Indonesia. So, even though the moderate group is actually dominant, their silence makes them seem like a minority. Based on the facts above, this paper attempts to discover the process of socialization and institutionalization of

moderate religious culture at *madrasahs* in Solo and why the practices of students' religious moderation have not been embodied in public spaces.

Literature Review

Etymologically, moderation comes from the Latin word *Moderatio*, which means balance, neither excessive nor deficiency. The word also implies self-control from an excessive or defective attitude. Thus, the word moderate is the opposite of liberal, radical, or extreme. Meanwhile, in Khaled Abu el Fadl's view, the word moderate means not leaning too much to the right or the left.¹⁹ In English, the word moderation is often used in the sense of average, middle, standard, or non-aligned. In general, moderate means prioritizing balance regarding beliefs, morals, and character when treating others as individuals and dealing with state institutions. Turning to Arabic, moderation is equal to *wasṭ* or *wastiyah*. In this case, Al-Qaradlawi said that the word *wasṭ* is identical to the words *tawāzun* (توازن) (balance) and fair. People who apply the principle of *wastiyah* can be called *wasiṭ*. In Arabic, the word *wastiyah* is also interpreted as "the best choice." Whatever word is used, they all imply the same meaning, namely fair, which in this context means choosing a middle ground between various extreme choices.²⁰

The word *wasṭ* has also been absorbed into the Indonesian language as the word "wāsit" means referee, which has three meanings, namely 1) intermediary, for example, in trade and business, 2) mediator (separator, peacemaker) between those in dispute, and 3) leader in a match.²¹ Meanwhile, technically, moderation means an attitude and view that is not excessive, extreme, or radical (*taṭarruf*). This is as stated in the chapter al-Baqarah: 143 of the Holy Qur'an, which reads: " *In the same way We made you a moderate Ummah (community), so that you should be witnesses over the people, and the Messenger a witness to you ...*" Similarly, Mohammad Hashim Kamali²² defines moderation by referring to its Arabic root, *wastiyah*, which is defined as a middle position between the two extreme poles, right and left. It is a concept understood as an effort to invite Muslims to realise the importance of tolerance in social life. This concept rises again as a discourse, in line with the less harmonious relations of religious life and the strengthening trend of Islamophobia in the world, especially after September 11 (9/11).

Turning to *madrasah* in Indonesia, it is a formal educational institution from primary to secondary schools whose curriculum refers to the national education curriculum but has more Islamic teaching than public schools. If public schools are under the Ministry

of Primary and Secondary Education, *madrasahs* are under the auspices of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. Initially, NU and Muhammadiyah had different focuses and concerns in developing schools. In contrast, NU was better known for producing religious knowledge, while Muhammadiyah was more advanced in developing non-religious knowledge. In general, education in NU is often considered more traditional, while Muhammadiyah is believed to be more advanced. Yet, each has its advantages. NU has contributed to developing pesantren and *madrasahs*, producing great 'ulama. In comparison, Muhammadiyah has developed modern schools from elementary to university.²³

So, pesantren have become a characteristic of NU that still exists today. On the other hand, Muhammadiyah wants Islamic education to adapt to modern education. NU *Madrasah* emphasised intense religious learning by maintaining the scientific traditions of previous scholars so that their books (*kitāb*) are still used today as references for learning Islam. Meanwhile, Muhammadiyah puts the works of classical scholars proportionally, not ideologically: not throwing them away but also not taking them entirely. Muhammadiyah does not follow one of the four Imams of the Sunni school of *fiqh* as they develop their own *manhaj* (methodology). Their jargon is to return to the Quran and the Sunnah. NU and Muhammadiyah madrasas are generally managed by the private sector. However, both contributed significantly to the national development, and each founder, K.H. Haysim Asyari of NU and K.H. Ahmad Dahlan of Muhammadiyah, once was under the teaching of a similar teacher.

Meanwhile, *madrasah Salafi* is a school that focuses on understanding and teaching Islam, which refers to the methods practised during the time of *Salafus Ṣālih* (first-generation Muslims) and *Salaf* scholars. The school prioritises understanding and memorising the Holy Qur'ān and hadith and emphasises the study of '*aqīdah* (Tawḥīd) and *fiqh* (Islamic law). They tend to maintain classical teaching traditions and methods, emphasising the memorisation of religious texts. Their jargon also goes back to the Holy Qur'ān and Sunnah. The last, MAN (state *madrasah*), is managed by the government, i.e., the Ministry of Religious Affairs. It aims to develop both religious and non-religious knowledge. Students are taught to be experts in both fields. MAN can be found in every province and has even become the leading school in Indonesia.²⁴

Then, as far as the issue of Islamic moderation is concerned, some studies have been carried out. Afsaruddin observes the trend of strengthening conservatism in the world after 9/11, emphasising the need for discourse on internal reform of society and

Islamic thought so that moderation can contribute to efforts to maintain a pluralist society, which must be coupled with the concepts of tolerance and pluralism. Moderation must be understood as fair behaviour in various areas of life, the application of which is universal.²⁵ In Indonesia, the strengthening of the discourse on religious moderation is in line with the trend of increasing movements of extreme-radical Islamic groups after the 1998 Reformation, which raised the issue of formalising Islamic law (*shari'ah*) and the ideology of the caliphate (*Khilafah Islamiyyah*) as a replacement for Pancasila.²⁶

According to Leo Suryadinata,²⁷ these movements can potentially disrupt political and economic stability and the integrity of the Republic of Indonesia. The movement has succeeded in infiltrating young Indonesian Muslims due to some factors: *firstly*, through online media, which is used as a space for self-image and dissemination of ideology²⁸ due to the high tendency of the young Muslim generation to seek religious knowledge through online media.²⁹ *Second*, educational institutions are a channel for spreading ideas and Islamisation movements after the failure of their movement in the political realm,³⁰ as well as a space for strengthening Islamic identity politics with claims to be the truest Islam and ideal Muslim.³¹ Nashuddin states³² this occurs due to the teachers' exclusive understanding and a dogmatic curriculum. *Third*, through family, which applies an authoritarian parenting style.³³

As a result, the initiative of the counter-narrative movement emerged, which emphasises the importance of religious understanding, attitudes, and practices that are friendly, accommodating to local cultural wisdom, and cooperative towards the state.³⁴ According to Achmad Asrori,³⁵ this movement calls for a change in the model of religious education, from the "inside the walls" model to the "outside the walls" model, from an orientation that forms an exclusive religious model to an inclusively oriented model of religious education; an education model that emphasises the importance of insight and awareness of humanist Islamic values³⁶ so that this concept must continue beyond the discourse level.

In addition, Faried F. Saenong's study of the role of Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) as a movement advocating moderate Islam,³⁷ moderation is a term contested in Indonesia in the 21st century. NU, as the most prominent Islamic mass organisation in Indonesia, succeeded in representing the interests of many different Indonesian Muslim social groups when it declared itself as an organisation that promotes a moderate Islamic discourse through the concept of Islam Nusantara. However, according to Mustaqim Pabbajah et. al.,³⁸ NU and Muhammadiyah face significant obstacles in dealing with the trend of conservative Islamic revival in Indonesia. Although these

organisations promote religious moderation as a means of upholding human dignity, they are threatened by internal challenges. Conservative Islamic organisations and their monopoly on universal truth are gaining power.

While Iqbal and Mabud argue that the Islamic concept of *wasatiyah* could be an alternative solution and, at the same time, capable of playing an essential role in overcoming the deadlock of dialogue between religions amidst the increasing threat of global extremism. It is because the concept *wasatiyah* encourages efforts towards peace and unity of the ummah. Schmid also affirms that a moderate Muslim does not try to impose Islamic law on non-Muslims.³⁹ A person who puts forward the values of humanism is not excessively fanatical and avoids all forms of violence. However, efforts to mainstream religious moderation must be cross-sectoral and recognise the existing social context. It requires the involvement and cooperation of many parties, so looking at the various factors or contexts surrounding an individual's religiosity is essential. This is because religiosity and socio-economic conditions, as Sa'diyah et al. said, positively and significantly influence moderate attitudes in individuals. All those papers have studied the issue of moderation but failed to discuss the role of *madrasahs* in religious moderation mainstreaming. Therefore, this study attempts to uncover how religious moderation mainstreaming is carried out in *madrasahs* through socialisation and institutionalisation processes, and how the students and teaching staff view religious moderation ideas.

Methodology

This paper is qualitative research that relies on the power of description to explain a phenomenon that becomes the object of study. Thus, through a qualitative approach, data that appears in the field can be obtained, thereby avoiding researcher bias. In qualitative research, the analysis will be conducted inductively.⁴⁰ In this pattern, the researcher's analysis is carried out by collecting empirical and theoretical data on the socialization and institutionalization processes of the moderate religious culture of *madrasahs* students in Solo. Solo is the city in the former Surakarta Residency, which includes Surakarta, Karanganyar, Sragen, Wonogiri, Sukoharjo, Klaten, and Boyolali. Now, these areas are more familiarly known as *Soloraya*. This study applies an ethnographic approach to examine personal involvement in constructing and reconstructing meaning through daily interaction processes and the culture surrounding it as a frame of perspective and behaviour.⁴¹ The data in this study were collected from in-depth interviews and field observations in *madrasahs* determined based on the pattern and character of the *madrasahs*, including State Islamic Senior High School (MAN), MA NU (Nahdlatul Ulama-based Islamic senior high school), MA

Muhammadiyah and Salafi schools. From each selected *madrasah*, 105 informants were chosen purposively from elements of the school principal, teaching staff, and students, especially intra-*madrasah* student organisations. Three processes of reduction, interpretation, and conclusion by Miles and Huberman are applied for data analysis.⁴²

Complexity of Religious Movement in Solo

After the 1998 Reformation Era, religious identity became more dominant in the public sphere, and the local cultural practices of the Javanese community are still more intimate and dominating.⁴³ If viewed from the perspective of interaction patterns, social structure, and economic aspects, the Solo people were initially traditional and agrarian. The social relations established are also very typical of the *keraton* (a palace in the Javanese Kingdom), i.e., *raja-kawula* or king and servant, with the livelihoods of most of the people being farmers. But this has encouraged change since the beginning of the 20th Century, along with the industrialisation and the emergence of intellectual groups that initiated movement organisations.⁴⁴ Besides, the wave of industrialisation that has penetrated this region since the 1900s has also influenced people's patterns and lifestyles. The typology of society that used to be predominantly rural has shifted to the industrial sector.⁴⁵ Therefore, the model of the patron-client relationship has not entirely disappeared but has shifted to a different form. From the *kawula-gusti* model, it becomes more fluid and tends to be dominated by factors of political interests and control of access to economic resources. It is reflected in the patronage model that has developed in vigilante groups that have emerged recently.

The level of religious plurality in Solo is relatively high. Based on data released by the Central Bureau of Statistics of Solo in 2019, there are Muslims, Catholics, Protestants, Hindus, Buddhists, Confucians, and various religious communities. Even though most of them are Muslim, *abangan* (syncretic) culture still dominates their religious practices. The Islamisation movement did occur massively, but the practice of religious life with syncretic nuances was still influential in daily life,⁴⁶ such as the tradition of *Satu Suro*, *Gerebeg Mulud*, *Sekaten*, *Malem Selikuran*, and *Tinggalan Dalem Jumenengan* held every year.

Islam has been embraced by the people of Solo since the Kingdom era, especially during the reign of Kasunanan. It was marked by the birth of the Pesantren Jamsaren in the 1750s, the emergence of various works of Islamic literature, the establishment of the Surakarta Grand Mosque, and the birth of the *Madrasah Mambaoel Oeloem* in 1905. In addition, Islam developed even more

rapidly with the emergence of various Islamic study activities initiated by the Sarekat Islam organisation. According to Wildan, these historical traces make Solo's Islamic style mix with Javanese cultural values to this day. However, at the same time, the syncretic culture cannot prevent them from being Muslims with intolerant and even radical characters.

Further, the Islamic movement in Solo has become increasingly complex since around the 1980s. The seeds of radicalism that have existed for a long time seem to have found a new axis and spirit along with the arrival of the *Tarbawi* and *Salafi* groups from the Middle East.⁴⁷ Apart from actively creating small groups (*halaqahs*) in several universities, establishing *ma'had* and religious learning forums, to political movements, and being affiliated with political parties, this group is also active in spreading its ideology through various media channels,⁴⁸ such as radio,⁴⁹ television, magazines, bulletins, and books. Therefore, Solo is a "paradise" for various ideological movements.⁵⁰ However, there are also kinds and practices of cooperation and peace initiatives carried out by this region's Muslim and Christian communities. Some groups or civil society organisations with a moderate wing have voiced the importance of tolerance. However, because their movement is not massive enough, their existence seems like a minority in the public sphere.

Madrasahs themselves, in the early of their birth in Solo, especially Mambaoel Oeloem, which became a place for teaching and disseminating Islamic teachings, a symbol of social mobility to create equality and became a social and political force that strengthens national awareness, apparently have not been able to optimally dominate the public space of Solo in voicing the importance of tolerance. In fact, the birth and development of *madrasahs* in Solo recently cannot be separated from the existence of the Mambaoel Oeloem.

Socialisation Process of the Moderate Religious Culture

Through Intra-curricular Activities

The first moderate religious culture socialisation model carried out by *madrasahs* is through extracurricular activities, namely integrating moderate Islamic values into the school's curriculum. Even though curriculum integration varies from one *madrasah* to another, the teaching staff are requested to impose religious moderation among students through each subject they teach in the class. For instance, integration practices of moderation at MAN are mainly carried out through the subjects of Islamic religious education, Islamic history, Islamic jurisprudence (*fiqh*), 'aqidah akhlak (Islamic

theology), and civic education by emphasising to students the importance of religious attitudes that are not extreme, tolerance, love for the motherland and anti-violence. It is because students have diverse backgrounds or religious organisation affiliations such as NU, Muhammadiyah, the Holy Qur'ān Interpretation Council (MTA), and the Indonesian Islamic Da'wah Institute (LDII).

The integration of moderate Islamic values into the subject of Islamic history was made by giving an example of the moderate attitude of the Prophet Muhammad (*The Final Prophet of Allah, Peace be Upon him, his Progeny and Companions*) when he was in Medina (interview with Bdy, July 12, 2021, and Ms, October 26, 2021). Meanwhile, in *fiqh*, the emphasis is on the importance of tolerance and finding common ground for religious organisations' different views, groups, and affiliations (interview with Ms, October 26, 2021). One example of the practice that is believed to be part of the learning process of moderate religious values is praying together (*salāt*). In contrast, the integration pattern through the subject of '*aqīdah akhlāq*' emphasises the importance of being religious people who always try to maintain togetherness and are sensitive and concerned about their social situations and conditions (interview with Swy, September 24, 2021). The diversity of religious backgrounds or affiliations of the students becomes the reason why *madrasahs* provide a contextual religious understanding. For example, the meaning of '*jihād*' by the teachers is correlated with the role and status of students as being severe in learning, not dealing with war on the battlefield.

As for the pattern of integration carried out through the subject of civic education, more emphasis is on mutual respect for differences (interview with Sry and As, November 29, 2021), creating a harmonious community life and maintaining the unity and integrity of NKRI (interview with Wdt and Sls, January 22, 2022). There is also a socialisation process carried out through the program of *Madrasah* Students *Ta 'aruf* Period, flag ceremonies on Monday, the commemoration of national holidays and religious holidays, as well as through posters posted in various corners of the *madrasah*, through the *madrasah*'s official social media accounts, and habituation activities (interview with ZFS and RR, November 23, 2021). Of all the integration patterns of religious moderation into the curriculum, MAN students understand the values very well as a form of tolerance. However, some of them stated that tolerance should only be practiced in the context of social and human relations and should not enter the realm of faith or doctrine (interview with DHA, AS, and AZF, January 28, 2021).

Turn to the socialisation of moderate religious culture through intra-curricular activities at MA Muhammadiyah, it is similar

to those at MAN, i.e., with a program of curriculum integration through the subjects of Islamic religious education, 'aqidah akhlāq, Islamic history, and civic education, except through English subject. The integration through the subject of 'aqidah akhlāq is practised by emphasising the importance of tolerance, respecting diversity and differences (interview with WH, September 10, 2021), and vertically having good morality to God and horizontally to fellow human beings (interview with SNH, November 10, 2021). Meanwhile, in Islamic history, more emphasis is on the importance of understanding the history and development of Islam contextually, practised through the habituation of reading the Holy Qur'ān and its meaning contextually. Its goal is for students to understand religious messages contextually and not lead them to violent attitudes and actions (interview with ZAA, November 11, 2021). Then, the subject of civic education dealt with the importance of loving the motherland and mutual respect for differences (interview with SNH, November 10, 2021). The difference at MA Muhammadiyah is its integration through English subjects by giving examples and reading materials that discuss diversity and harmony (interview with MZF, November 15, 2021). So, in this school, the teachings of moderation have been understood as a practice of tolerance; some teachers and students argue that tolerance should only be practised in social relations, not in terms of faith (interview with SNH, January 13, 2022).

In contrast, the socialisation of moderation at MA NU is mainly carried out by teaching the doctrine *Ahl Sunnah wa al-Jamā'ah an-Nahdliyyah (Aswaja)*. It is also integrated through Islamic religious education subject and civic education. The pattern of integration through the teaching of *Aswaja* emphasises the importance of the principles of *tasamuh* (tolerance), *tawassuṭ* (middle position), *tawāzun* (balance), and *i'tidāl* (fair), respecting each other and not mocking other religions or sects, and the importance of maintaining national unity and integrity. However, there is an MA NU that has no specific pattern of integrating religious moderation values into the learning curriculum, such as MA Al-Azhar (interview with JS, January 13, 2022). The staff believes that religious moderation has become part of the daily practices of the school, which can be seen from the students who have understood the moderation concept as not being extreme, not standing one-sided, not too rigid, and not too liberal (interview with NS, SW, and SS, January 13, 2022).

The integration through the teaching of *Aswaja* is by giving examples of prominent figures, stories of national figures, or moderate 'ulama such as K.H. Hasyim Asy'ari, NU founder.⁵¹ The exemplary model of moderation is practiced by *Walisongo* (nine Muslim saints in Java), who spread Islam through local community

culture as reflected in the practices of pilgrimage to the tomb (*ziyārat*), delivering prayers to the dead (*tahlīlān*), a seventh-month celebration of the pregnant mother (*mitoni*), and prayers for good luck (*selametan*) (interview with MR & BG, September 09, 2021). In today's context, moderation is necessary as the state is facing serious threats due to the growth of the Islamic organisation movement that supported the establishment of an Islamic caliphate. Therefore, the school encouraged its students and teaching staff to participate in the flag ceremony where Pancasila (Indonesian state philosophy) is recited together.

A somewhat different integration pattern was carried out by MA Al-Falah where material related to religious moderation is provided through the subject of *fiqh* and *ta'lim muta'allim*. Through these two subjects, students are drilled with an understanding of various views, religious practices, and their arguments. The goal for students is to become tolerant, not trapped in excessive fanaticism or radicalism, and uphold the principles of unity in diversity, Pancasila, and the 1945 Constitution. As a result, the students of the *madrasah* know that the efforts of any group that wants to replace the foundation of the state with Islamic principles are unacceptable as the state belongs not only to Muslims but to all Indonesian citizens regardless of their religious background.

In contrast, MA Alpansa carries out moderation integration through local-based subjects. For instance, the students of class X will learn about NU history, the Javanese language, and the history of *Mbah Lim* (K.H. Muslim Rifa'i Imampuro) with a focus on the history of the birth of Pancasila and the Republic of Indonesia. Then, Class XI learns the history of *Mbah Lim*, Pancasila, and NU with an introduction to Indonesian politics. This is where the teaching related to the history of the birth and the relationship between Pancasila and NU and their development are given. While, Class XII will directly learn about the construction of the independent character of students, i.e., the provision of educational and micro-teaching abilities. Although the pattern of integration carried out by MA NU is unique and has succeeded in delivering knowledge about the practice of moderation, some teachers argue that the practice of tolerance or moderation can not be applied in all cases.

Lastly, the intra-curricular socialisation model carried out by MA Salafi emphasises moderation values in the form of obedience to the government (interview with UY, AS, UD, & AAW, November 2, 202). The educational model is more directed at strengthening Islamic understanding by emphasising Islamic *manhaj*. So far, this school's curriculum is the *Tawhīd*-Based Islamic Education Curriculum, in which *Tawhīd* is the pivot for all learning materials and processes

(interview with UY, November 2, 2021). However, the students have never participated in interfaith events or activities with local traditions, such as *Sekaten* (prophet birthday celebration in Solo and Yogyakarta), *Selametan*, and others. These Salafi schools emphasise the importance of making the Holy Qur'ān and Sunnah the primary reference in life. So obedience to the government is allowed as long as its policies do not violate Islamic law, including policies related to religious moderation. Even though students understand moderation as a religious attitude that is not extreme and the importance of tolerance, they believe it must not enter the domain of faith and does not conflict with Islamic law (interview with ZM, FA, and HM, January 16, 2022).

Through Extracurricular Activities

The second model of socialisation is carried out by *madrasahs* through extracurricular activities. Although each *madrasah* has different extracurricular activities, the orientation of all these activities is strengthening love for the motherland (interview with SB & MS, November 10, 2021), increasing Arabic literacy and maintaining traditions their predecessors passed down. Several extracurricular activities in private and state *madrasahs* used to socialise with moderate religious culture students are scouts, flag hoisting troop (*Paskibraka*), and Youth Red Cross (Palang Merah Remaja, PMR). However, there are also other kinds of extracurricular activities, depending on the characteristics of each *madrasah*, such as Rohis, the art of reciting the Holy Qur'ān at MAN 1 Surakarta; sports, book studies, and arts at MAN 1 Sragen; and reading and writing Arabic to improve the ability to recite and understand the Holy Qur'ān and Arabic texts correctly and precisely at MAN 1 Klaten.

Meanwhile, in MA Muhammadiyah, the socialisation process of moderate religious culture is carried out through the school program of *Hizbul Wathon* for the scouting program (interview with WH, November 10, 2021). However, not all Muhammadiyah schools use similar name, such as MA Muhammadiyah Bekonang; such a program is called scouting (interview with SNH, November 10, 2021). Meanwhile, in the MA NU, apart from Scouting, *Paskibraka* and PMR extracurricular activities, some have the program of *istighosah*, seeking help from Allah Almighty by praying together (interview with YM & MR, September 1, 2021). This activity is carried out routinely every *Kliwon Friday* (Javanese calendar) at the grave of the founder of the pesantren. The goal is for students always to remember the message of the founder of the pesantren, which was to protect the NKRI and practice Pancasila values in everyday life. While in MA Salafi,

although not all have *Pandu Hidayatullah* extracurricular program, a kind of Scouting activity, it is a program that is believed to be part of the socialisation of a culture of moderation by inviting the Indonesian National Army and Police officers as trainers (interview with AS, October 23, 21).

Through Social Roles in Society

The third model of socialisation of moderation is carried out by *madrasahs* by involving students in the daily life of the community. Two approaches are used in this regard. First, it is carried out institutionally as part of the *madrasah* socialisation program. It becomes a space for students to implement the knowledge they have gained from school in the community. Second, it is carried out independently by students in their respective neighbourhoods. These two socialisation models are only found in MAN, MA Muhammadiyah, and MA NU. MAN initiated programs called Ramadhan Dakwah Camping (RDC), Dakwah Ramadhan (DR), Social Service and Tarawih Touring (BSTK), and Study Tour (ST) (interview with SB, MQ, RR, Ysk, Sls, Nf and Tm, January 22, 2022). CDR is a space for students to gain experience regarding the practice of tolerance in a diverse community environment. The DR and BSTK programs are usually carried out for 2 to 3 days in the last ten days of Ramadhan through activities such as teaching about Islam, helping to distribute *zakāt*, holding bazaars, and teaching kindergartens.

Then, the study tour program is usually made by visiting communities of different beliefs and traditions, such as learning about the prohibition of Balinese people slaughtering cows, the tradition of *sesajen* (the dishes and flowers in religious rituals to serve supernatural beings), and the like. This is where they know the importance of tolerance and understand that each tradition has meaning and is part of certain community beliefs. While the independent socialisation activities by students are seen from their involvement in youth organisations, religion, and other social activities in their respective neighbourhoods, such as their involvement in regional cultural festival activities, which became a space for them to interact and get to know firsthand the diversity of religions and cultures in their surroundings, including the experience of interaction with different religious sects or non-Muslims (interview with IP, MFL, FW, WMF TA, DS, Irf, Fmg, Fza, and RDP, January 12, 2022).

Meanwhile, in MA Muhammadiyah, the third socialisation model is mainly carried out through social activities, such as *takziah* (*ta'ziah*) (conveying condolence to the one who passed away),

routine Ramaḍān programs at the PKU Muhammadiyah mosque, and social services. *Takziah* is usually carried out when a person dies around the *madrasah*, either Muslim or non-Muslim. The Ramaḍān program at PKU is carried out by attending religious events and distributing *zakat al-fitr*. For social services, the program is like distributing Qurbān meat on *Eid al-Adha* (The Feast of sacrifice) and cleaning the environment around the *madrasah* with the locals (interview with AP, IW, WH, JS, Ilh, Sls 11/15/21). Students gain experience interacting directly with people of different sects and religions from all these activities.

Whereas in the MA NU, this model of socialisation is students' involvement in seminars on the theme of religious moderation, youth organisations, and *haul* of the pesantren, which become a space for students to gain experience interacting and collaborating with various people, cultures, traditions, and religion (interview with Ubd, FNA, FR, AR, SM, VS, HN, RP, RDU, AAW, AAR, AQ, SFM, NNS, ASF, LNA, ZMH, MLH, February 14, 2022). Another socialisation model is in the form of compulsory *madrasah* activities, such as the Field Experience Practice (PPL) and Field Work Practice (PKL) programs (interview with YM & Rym, September 1, 21). Students will live in the community for two days to one week through this activity. The result is that students gain experience interacting directly with people from various sects and beliefs, such as NU, Muhammadiyah, LDII, Abangan, Wahidiyyah, Salafi, and non-Muslims.

Of the three models of socialisation above, integration of religious moderation into the school curriculum can be the most effective way to cultivate a moderate religious culture in *madrasahs* because the information and knowledge provided to students are diverse. However, such a pattern will be ineffective when educators do not fully understand the concept of religious moderation itself. In other words, the teaching staff greatly influences and determines this pattern of curriculum integration.

If the teaching staff is moderate, the knowledge delivered to students will undoubtedly align with the values and indicators of religious moderation. Likewise, if the teaching staff is not moderate or does not understand the concept of religious moderation correctly, students will not be moderate. The role of these educators, besides being interpreters and implementers of the curriculum, also determines the form, process, and success of learning oriented towards moderation. Even though students have understood moderation as a practice of tolerance, the practice of tolerance, if only at the social level or as long as it does not conflict with Islamic

law, shows that the socialisation process of moderation is still at the discourse level, not practical.

Schools		Programs	Result
MAN	Intra-curricular	School subjects: Islamic history, <i>fiqh</i> , 'aqīdah <i>akhlāq</i> (Islamic theology), and civic education	Students have a proper understanding of Islamic moderation but must not transgress the limit, i.e. entering the realm of faith
	Extracurricular	Scouting, flag hoisting troop (<i>Paskibraka</i>), and Youth Red Cross (PMR)	
	Social roles	Ramadan Dakwah Camping, Dakwah Ramadhan, Social Service, Tarawih Touring, and Study Tour	
MA Muhammadiyah	Intracurricular	School subjects: Islamic history, 'aqīdah <i>akhlāq</i> , civic education, and English.	Students understood moderation practically as the practice of tolerance. Yet, it is limited to social relations.
	Extracurricular	<i>Hizbul Wathon</i> (scouting)	
	Social roles	<i>Takziah</i> , distributing <i>zakat al-fitr</i> and meat on <i>Eid al-Adha</i>	
MA NU	Intracurricular	Teaching the doctrine <i>Aswaja</i> by emphasising the concept of <i>tasamuh</i> , <i>tawassut</i> ,	Students understood moderation as being in the middle position and fair. Some

		<i>tawāzun</i> , and <i>i'tidal</i> . Practicing the local tradition such as <i>tahlilan</i> , <i>selametan</i> , <i>mitoni</i> , and <i>ziyārah</i>	argue that moderation can not be applied in all cases
	Extracurricular	Scouting, flag hoisting troop, PMR, istighosah	
	Social roles	Join a seminar on religious moderation, youth organisations, and <i>haul</i> of the pesantren,	
	Intracurricular	Emphasising Islamic <i>manhaj</i> by making the Qur'ān and Sunnah the only reference. The school curriculum is oriented toward the principle of <i>Tawhīd</i>	
MA Salafi	Extracurricular	<i>Pandu Hidayatullah</i> (scouting)	
	Social roles	None	

Table 1: Socialisation Process of the Moderate Religious Culture in *madrasahs*

Institutionalisation Process of the Moderate Religious Culture

Moderation as a Cultural System

Making moderation a cultural system means putting moderation as values, norms, rules, and other ideal things in which the individual thinks, acts, and behaves. As carried out by MAN, moderation is the foundation in preparing plans, processes, and implementation of all learning activities, with the aim that students can understand the reality of diversity that exists in their surroundings

and the importance of tolerance, togetherness, peace, avoiding all kinds of violence and imposing will. Some *madrasahs* also make moderation part of the student rules and code of ethics, such as the prohibition of bullying, excessive fanaticism in religion, and prohibiting bringing attributes of certain religious sects or organisations in schools (interview with RR, Sry, AS, Swy, MQ, SB, & Rtn, September 23, 2021). Besides, some *madrasahs* use moderation as a guideline for teachers and trainers for all student activities (interview with MS, Irf, Fmg, Fza, & Jrwn, October 26, 2021).

Meanwhile, in the MA Muhammadiyah, moderation is part of the guidelines for instilling student character (interview with WH, Strn, SNH, & MZF, November 10, 2021). All teaching staff refer to these guidelines in the learning process so students understand the importance of tolerance, avoiding violence, maintaining and protecting human dignity, and maintaining harmony. However, some students argued that tolerance should only be carried out in the context of social relations, not in terms of faith (interview with Rth, Ilh, Sls, NZ, ZN, AP, Hrn, Nrl, & Nn, January 13, 2022).

In contrast, at MA NU, the subject *ta'līm muta'allim* and *Aswaja* become paradigms and guidelines for moderate attitude and behaviour, and become the basis for the entire process and implementation of learning, joint guidelines in attitude and behaviour, mandatory prerequisites for graduating from school and guidelines for the recruitment of *madrasah* education staffs (interview with Ryn, MR, AAW, BG, September 4, 2021). Apart from that, some *madrasahs* make the ideas, thoughts, and behaviour of the founder of the pesantren a reference for moderate attitudes and behaviour. From this model, students understand moderation as being tolerance, love for the motherland, protecting the NKRI, and not being extreme in religion (interview with Ubd, FNA, FR, AR, AAW, YM, February 14, 2022), being open when interacting with various people, cultures and traditions, as well as understanding the importance of tolerance (interview with ASF, LNA, ZMH, MLH, SM, VS, HN, RP, SB, DJ, ZFM, Msh, NS, SW, SS, HS, HU, AH, & DA, January 22, 2022). A different institutional model is found in the Salafi *Madrasah*, where moderation is more directed at strengthening understanding of the Qur'an and Sunnah (interview with UD, UY, AS, AAW, December 22, 2021).

Moderation as a Social System

Placing moderation as a social system means positioning moderation as a descriptive concept that manifests into traditional action patterns. This institutionalisation model is carried out by

madrasahs through a habituation program. As carried out by the state *madrasahs*, the habituation activities carried out include, among others, prayers together and *istighotsah*, whose technical implementation refers to the "Islamic life guidelines" published by the school, containing various recitations in salat and prayer guidelines, as well as views and its legal basis (interview with RR, Swy, AS, & Rtn, September 23, 2021). However, not all *madrasahs* have similar guidelines. From this model, students understand the various recitations in *salat* and the legal basis as well as arguments for each difference. It hopes students will no longer have truth claims and consider others as mistakes, *bid'ah* (innovation), or heresy.

Placing moderation as a social system means positioning moderation as a descriptive concept that manifests into traditional action patterns. This institutionalisation model is carried out by *madrasahs* through a habituation program. As carried out MAN, the habituation activities carried out include, among others, prayers together and *istighosah*, whose technical implementation refers to the "Islamic life guidelines" published by the school, containing various recitations in *salat* and prayer guidelines, as well as views and its legal basis. However, not all *madrasahs* have similar guidelines. From this model, students understand the various recitations in *salat* and the legal basis and arguments for each difference (interview with Swy, AS, Rtn, RR, September 24, 2021). It hopes students will no longer have truth claims and judge other groups as misguided or committing *bid'ah* (innovation).

Moderation as a Holistic and Contextual Personality

Moderation as a holistic and contextual personality is one of the models for institutionalising a moderate religious culture, which is carried out by involving students in community life. A community service program aims to bring students closer to the community and create a space to practice the knowledge they have gained from the class. Students will live and carry out daily activities with the community through this activity.

This service model by MAN is carried out in several forms, including *Ramadhan Da'wah Camping* (RDC), social service and mobile *Tarāwih* (interview with Jrwn, SB, MQ, RR, October 26, 2021). Similarly, MA Muhammadiyah organises students during Ramadān to give a speech for religious events at the PKU Muhammadiyah hospital mosque and social service in the form of being *zakat fitrah* distributors and sacrificial animal meat during *Eid al-Adhā* (interview with WH, AP, & JS, January 13, 2022). Meanwhile, in MA NU, the program involves students in the community in the form of Practical Field Experience (PPL) and Field

Work Practices (PKL) (interview with YM & Ryn, September 1. 2021). Students, especially those in class XII, will live in the community for three days through this program so that students can be directly involved in various social-community activities. Last, in MA Salafi, the moderation institutionalisation model is more directed at strengthening the Islamic character of students based on shari'ah.

Approaches		Programs
Cultural system	MAN	Making moderation a foundation in preparing plans, processes, and implementation of all learning activities as well as rules and code of conduct
	MA Muhammadiyah	Making moderation a guideline for instilling student character in the learning process
	MA NU	Making the subject <i>ta 'lim muta 'allim</i> and <i>Aswaja</i> paradigm and guideline for instilling moderate attitude and behaviour and the founder of the pesantren as a role model
	MA Salafi	Strengthening students understanding of the Holy Qur'ān and Sunnah
Contextual personality	MAN	Organizing <i>Ramadhan Da'wah Camping</i> (RDC), social service and mobile <i>Tarawih</i>
	MA Muhammadiyah	during Ramadan to give a speech for religious events at the PKU Muhammadiyah hospital mosque during Ramaḍān, being <i>zakat fitrah</i> distributors and sacrificial animal meat during
	MA NU	Directly involved in social community services through PPL & PKL program
	MA Salafi	<i>Shari'ah</i> -based personal characters of the students
Social system	MAN	Habituation programs such as prayers (<i>salāt</i>) together among students and learning the difference from legal basis so that students are supposed not to have truth claims. However, every <i>madrasah</i> has different guidelines
	MA Muhammadiyah	
	MA NU	
	MA Salafi	

Table 2: Institutionalisation Process of the Moderate Religious Culture in madrasahs

The three models of institutionalising moderate religious culture above must be carried out continuously and repeatedly so it will become a habit.⁵² Even though every *madrasah* has different forms and patterns of institutionalisation programs, they have similar goals in instilling a moderate religious culture among students. The three models above become media for objectification, internalisation, and externalisation of moderate values so that the students can learn moderation's values, attitudes, and behaviours in the *madrasah* environment. Students believe Islam teaches its adherents not to be extreme but moderate in all aspects of life and must accept and respect every difference. Even though some argue that tolerance should not enter the realm of faith but merely in dealing with social interaction, many believe that religious intellectuality, religious practice, and religious experience influence individuals more moderately.⁵³ In other words, students' understanding of religious moderation tends to follow the ideology and religious practices of the *madrasah* where they study. Therefore, institutionalisation and socialisation programs of moderate religious cultures in *madrasahs* are necessary.

Then, the institutionalisation and socialisation program of moderation in *madrasahs* aligns with the government's goals in campaigning moderation through educational institutions. First, a moderate attitude must be able to respect differences. This is manifested in students' participation in social activities. In addition, they also learn about differences among Muslims, even in matters of worship, and why they differ from each other in their arguments. Second, by increasing understanding, for example, MA NU students participate in seminars on moderation. In addition, moderation has also been integrated into the school curriculum, which is implemented through several subjects. Third, by practising religious values; religious moderation also teaches the importance of practising religious values in everyday life, such as honesty, compassion, and peace, manifested in *takziyah* activities, *tahlilan*, and the Youth Red Cross program. Fourth, creating dialogue to strengthen relations between religious groups. In dialogue, each party is expected to be able to listen to and understand the views of others and find solutions that can benefit all parties. Fifth, maintain a calm attitude and do not be easily provoked.⁵⁴ In situations that may cause conflict, a calm and unprovoked attitude is an attitude that is very necessary for religious moderation. This can help avoid conflict and maintain harmonious relationships.

In addition, the success of religious moderation in the lives of Indonesian society can be seen from the following four main indicators, namely national commitment i.e., acceptance of the principles of the nation as stated in the constitution (in the context

of Indonesia, namely Pancasila, the 1945 Constitution and regulations that follow, tolerance, anti-violence, and acceptance of tradition. Maintaining tradition is very important as long as it does not contradict the teachings of Islam. Moreover, Indonesia has diverse traditions and cultures, so students must learn to accept existing traditions, as applied to *madrasah* students in Solo.

Conclusion

This study discovered different ways of socializing and institutionalizing moderate religious culture at *madrasahs*. *Madrasah* has implemented several programs, such as intra-curricular activities, namely the implantation of moderate values through school subjects, then extracurricular activities, and social roles. Through these activities, students generally have understood the concept of religious moderation well in the sense of being in the middle position, not extreme right or left. This moderate attitude is a pure character of Muslims as stated in the Holy Qur'ān that Muslims are *ummatan wasatān* (middle community). However, socialisation and institutionalisation in *madrasahs* have not been implemented widely. They are mainly carried out in classrooms with a significant reliance on teachers and without applying social media. Additionally, the practices have not yet included interreligious literacy, resulting in the development of moderation as a form of group action. Such an approach just makes the socialisation and institutionalisation of moderate religious culture cease at the level of discourse, not reaching the level of practice in the best way possible. Even though teachers and students have understood moderation as a form of religious attitude without being extreme right or left and also the importance of tolerance and respect for every difference, many still believe that tolerance should only be applied in a social context, not entering the realm of faith ('aqīdah) and not contrary to *shari'ah*.

Therefore, the campaign for religious moderation still needs to be strengthened, especially among students. Students must be equipped with digital literacy skills as most information is currently obtained through social media, including when searching for information about religious knowledge. The youth today tend to learn everything instantly, including learning about Islam. In addition, social media users in Indonesia are generally dominated by teenagers, including those of school age. Students have a significant role in campaigning for Islamic moderation. So, they can be either the leading players or even victims, depending on how we educate them at schools. Another way to strengthen moderate attitudes is through social interaction, where students interact directly with people from different socio-religious backgrounds. This can be made through interfaith dialogue or other cooperation in the social domain. So, dialogue is not aimed at finding common ground in beliefs between different religious adherents. Students are not sufficiently equipped

with religious moderation knowledge, so moderation does not stop at the discourse level. Instead, they must have direct experience, such as being a minority or engaging in a diverse religious community, to get more meaningful life lessons so that their moderate attitudes and views grow naturally.

Thus, it can be seen that religious intellectuality, practice, and experience greatly influence whether an individual will become moderate or not. Finally, if viewed from the four indicators of religious moderation, this study found there are three categories of *madrasahs* in Solo; 1) moderate *madrasahs* that include state *madrasahs* and NU-based *madrasahs*; 2) less moderate, meaning putting aside local tradition or culture, such as Muhammadiyah-based *madrasahs*, and 3) moderate but potential to be not moderate, i.e., Salafi-based *madrasahs*.

Notes and References

¹ Nur Kafid, “Political Clientelism as the Way of Survival of Radical Islamic Group Movement in Cianjur, West Java,” *Walisongo: Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Keagamaan* 26, no. 1 (2018): 67–93, <https://doi.org/10.21580/ws.26.1.2300>.

² Jajang Jahroni, “Political Economy of Knowledge: Salafism in Post-Soeharto Urban Indonesia” (Dissertation, Boston University, 2015).

³ Birgit Bräuchler, “Islamic Radicalism Online: The Moluccan Mission of the Laskar Jihad in Cyberspace,” *The Australian Journal of Anthropology* 15, no. 3 (2004): 253–71. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1835-9310.2004.tb00098.x>

⁴ Suaidi Asyari, “Incorporating Islamism into Secular Education System: An Attempt of Gradual Islamization of the State and Society by an Indonesian Tarbiyah Movement in Jambi,” *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 11, no. 1 (2017): 29–58, <https://doi.org/1i0n.t1o56S4ec2u/lJaIrISE.d2u0c1a7ti.o11n.1S.y2s9te-m58>.

⁵ Abdallah, “Exclusivism and Radicalism in Schools: State Policy and Educational Politics Revisited,” *Studia Islamika: Indonesian Journal for Islamic Studies* 23, no. 3 (2016): 625–32. <https://doi.org/10.15408/sdi.v23i3.4425>

⁶ SETARA Institute, “Laporan Survey: Toleransi Siswa SMA Negeri di Jakarta & Bandung Raya” (Jakarta, 2016), <https://setara-institute.org/laporan-survei-status-toleransi-siswa-sma-di-jakarta-dan-bandung-raya/>.

⁷ Jeremy Menchik, “Moderate Muslims and Democratic Breakdown in Indonesia,” *Asian Studies Review* 43, no. 3 (2019): 1–19, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10357823.2019.1627286>.

⁸ Achmad Asrori, “Contemporary Religious Education Model on the Challenge of Indonesian Multiculturalism,” *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 10, no. 2 (2016): 261–84, <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2016.10.2.261-284>.

⁹ Claudin Nef Saluz, “Youth and Pop Culture in Indonesian Islam,” *Studia Islamika: Indonesian Journal for Islamic Studies* 16, no. 2 (2009): 215–42. <https://doi.org/10.15408/sdi.v16i2.481>

¹⁰ Asef Bayat & Linda Herrera, “Being Young and Muslim: New Cultural Politics in the Global South and North,” ed. Asef Bayat Linda Herrea (London: Oxford University Press, 2010), h. 3-26.

¹¹ Rosninawati Hussin, Sofia Hayati Yusoff, and Siti Nubailah Mohd Yusof, “Islamic Representation in Television Advertising and Its Impact on Modern Malay Muslim Women,” *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 211, no. September (2015): 890–95, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.11.117>.

¹² Martin Slama, "Practising Islam through Social Media in Indonesia," *Indonesia and the Malay World* 46, no. 134 (2018): 1–4, <https://doi.org/10.1080/13639811.2018.1416798>.

¹³ Muhammad Faiq, "Understanding Radicalists and Fundamentalist Islamic Groups in Indonesia: Ideology and Model of Movement. *Tasamu: Jurnal Studi Islam* 13, no. 1 (2021): 41–68. <https://doi.org/10.47945/tasamu.v13i1.351>

¹⁴ Mohammed Abu-Nimer, *Nirkekerasan Dan Bina-Damai Dalam Islam: Teori Dan Praktik*, ed. Ihsan Ali-Fauzi & Rizal Panggabean, Bahasa Ind (Jakarta: Democracy Project, 2010), h. 165-166

¹⁵ M. Quraish Shihab, *Wasathiyah: Wawasan Islam Tentang Moderasi Beragama*, 1st ed. (Ciputat: Lentera Hati, 2019)

¹⁶ Pierre Bourdieu, *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste* (USA: Harvard University Press, 1984).

¹⁷ Mumuh Muhtarom, "Urgensi Penguatan Pemikiran Moderasi Islam dalam Pendidikan Agama di Madrasah," *Tatar Pasundan: Jurnal Diklat Keagamaan* XII, no. 32 (2018): 39–47. <https://doi.org/10.38075/tp.v12i32.53>

¹⁸ Alexander R. Arifianto, "The State of Political Islam in Indonesia: The Historical Antecedent and Future Prospects," *Asia Policy* 15, no. 4 (2020): 111–32. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/27023942>.

¹⁹ Rohmat Mulyana, "Religious moderation in Islamic religious education textbook and implementation in Indonesia," *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies* 79, no. 1 (2023), 1-8 pages. doi:<https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v79i1.8592>

²⁰ Sahkholid Nasution, Hasan Asari, & Harun Al-Rasyid, "Kitab Kuning and Religious Moderation: A Study on State Islamic Universities in Indonesia," *Journal of Al-Tamaddun* 19, no. 2 (2024): 73–88. <https://doi.org/10.22452/JAT.vol19no2.5>

²¹ Achmad Solechan, Muhammad Luthfi Zuhdi, and Muhammad Syauqillah. 2024. "The Influence of Islamic Religious Education Based on Religious Moderation and National Defence on The Nationalism of Students," *Journal of Ecohumanism* 3, no. 6 (2024): 628-36. <https://doi.org/10.62754/joe.v3i6.4031>.

²² Mohammad Hashim Kamali, *The Middle Path of Moderation in Islam: The Qur'anic Principle of Wasathiyah* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015), 9-15.

²³ M. Eka Mahmud & Umiarso, "School Leadership Models and Efforts Reconstruction of Religious Moderation in State Madrasah Aliyah in Indonesia," *Educational Process: International Journal* 14, (2025): e2025018. <https://doi.org/10.22521/edupij.2025.14.18>

²⁴ Hasyim Haddade, H., Nur, A., Achruh, A., Rasyid, M.N.A. and Ibrahim, A., "Madrasah management strategies through Madrasah Reform program: an evidence from Indonesia," *International Journal of Educational Management* 38, no. (2024): 5, pp. 1289-1304. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEM-05-2023-0236>

²⁵ Asma Afsaruddin, "The Hermeneutics of Inter-Faith Relations: Retrieving Moderation and Pluralism as Universal Principles in Qur'anic Exegeses," *Journal of Religious Ethics* 37, no. 2 (2009): 331–354. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9795.2009.00389.x>

²⁶ Suratno, "Sufism and Peace: The Profile and Role of Shaykh Husamuddin in the Deradicalisation Program," *Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism* 11, no 2 (2022): 203-222. <https://doi.org/10.21580/tos.v11i2.17577>

²⁷ Suryadinata, By Leo, and Leo Suryadinata. Introduction. In *Pancasila and the Challenge of Political Islam: Past and Present*, vii–viii. Trends in Southeast Asia. ISEAS–Yusof Ishak Institute, 2018.

²⁸ Birgit Bräuchler, "Islamic Radicalism Online: The Moluccan Mission of the Laskar Jihad in Cyberspace," *The Australian Journal of Anthropology* 15, no. 3 (2004): 253–271. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1835-9310.2004.tb00098.x>

²⁹ Dayana Lengauer, "Sharing Semangat Taqwa: Social Media and Digital Islamic Socialities in Bandung," *Indonesia and the Malay World* 46, no. 134 (2018): 5–23. DOI:<https://doi.org/10.1080/13639811.2018.1415276>

³⁰ Suaidi Asyari, "Incorporating Islamism into Secular Education System: An Attempt of Gradual Islamization of the State and Society by an Indonesian Tarbiyah

Movement in Jambi," *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 11, no. 1 (2017): 29–58. DOI: [10.15642/JIIS.2017.11.1.29-58](https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2017.11.1.29-58)

³¹ Yanwar Pribadi, "Sekolah Islam (Islamic Schools) as Symbols of Indonesia's Urban Muslim Identity," *TRaNS: Trans-Regional and-National Studies of Southeast Asia* 10, no. 2 (2022): 1–16. DOI:10.1017/trn.2021.15

³² Nashuddin, "Aktualisasi Nilai-Nilai Pendidikan Islam dalam Merevitalisasi Pemahaman Moderasi pada Lembaga Pendidikan di Indonesia: Analisis Praksis dan Kebijakan," *Schemata Journal* 9, no. 1 (2020): 33–52. <https://doi.org/10.20414/schemata.v9i1.2159>

³³ Muhammad Wildan dan Alimatul Qibtiyah, "Parenting Style and the Level of Islamism among Senior High School Students in Yogyakarta," *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 14, no. 1 (2020): 187–209. DOI: [10.15642/JIIS.2020.14.1.187-209](https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2020.14.1.187-209)

³⁴ Nur Syam & Nawawi, "Islam Nusantara Berkemajuan sebagai Basis Moderasi Islam di Indonesia," *ISLAMICA: Jurnal Studi Keislaman* 13, no. 2 (2019): 236–255. <https://doi.org/10.15642/islamica.2019.13.2.303-322>

³⁵ Achmad Asrori, "Contemporary Religious Education Model on the Challenge of Indonesian Multiculturalism," *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 10, no. 2 (2016): 261–284. DOI: [10.15642/JIIS.2016.10.2.261-284](https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2016.10.2.261-284)

³⁶ Masnur Alam, "A Collaborative Action in the Implementation of Moderate Islamic Education to Counter Radicalism," *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change* 11, no. 7 (2020): 497–516. https://www.ijicc.net/images/vol11iss7/11742_Alam_2020_E_R.pdf

³⁷ Faried F. Saenong, "Nahdlatul Ulama (NU): A Grassroots Movement Advocating Moderate Islam," in *Handbook of Islamic Sects and Movements*, 1st ed. (Netherlands: Brill Leiden the Neterlands, 2021), 129–150, https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.1163/j.ctv1v7zbv8.1?seq=4#metadata_info_tab_contents.

³⁸ Hasse Jubba, Jaffary Awang, Zuly Qodir, Hannani & Mustaqim Pabbajah, "The Contestation between Conservative and Moderate Muslims in Promoting Islamic Moderatism in Indonesia," *Cogent Social Sciences* 8, no. 1 (2022): 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2022.2116162>

³⁹ Alex P. Schmid, *Moderate Muslims and Islamist Terrorism: Between Denial and Resistance* (Leiden, 2017), 1-28.

⁴⁰ John W. Creswell, *Research Design: Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif and Mixed*. Translated by Achmad Fawaid (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2012).

⁴¹ Peter L. Berger dan Thomas Luckmann, *Tafsir Sosial atas Kenyataan: Risalah tentang Sosiologi Pengetahuan*, Cetakan ke (Jakarta: LP3ES, 2013), 63-125.

⁴² Matthew B. Miles, A. Michael Huberman, Johnny Saldana, *Qualitative Data Analysis* (New York: SAGE, 2014)

⁴³ Claudia Seise, "Islamic Authority Figures and Their Religioscapes in Indonesia," *Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism* 10, no. 1 (2021): 37-58. <https://doi.org/10.21580/tos.v10i1.8441>

⁴⁴ Hermanu Joebagio, *Islam dan Kebangsaan di Keraton Surakarta: Dari Paku Buwana IV hingga Paku Buwana X*, I (Sukoharjo: Dio Media, 2017), 2-39.

⁴⁵ Suzanne April Brenner, "The Domestication of Desire: Women, Wealth, and Modernity in Java" (London: Princeton University Press, 1998).

⁴⁶ Mutohharun Jinan, "Melacak Akar Ideologi Puritanisme Islam: Survei Biografi atas 'Tiga Abdullah," *Walisonsong: Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Keagamaan* 22, no. 2 (2014): 381–412. <https://doi.org/10.21580/ws.22.2.271>

⁴⁷ Quintan Wiktorowicz, "Anatomy of the Salafi Movement," *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism* 29, no. 3 (2006): 207–39. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10576100500497004>

⁴⁸ Sunarwoto, "Contesting Religious Authority: A Study on Dakwah Radio in Surakarta, Indonesia" (A Dissertation Submitted to Tilburg University, 2015).

⁴⁹ Noorhaidi Hasan & Mibtadin, "Penerbit Literatur Keislaman di Surakarta: Kontestasi, Ideologi, dan Ekonomi dalam Perspektif Gerakan Sosial," in *Tren Pemikiran Islam Di Indonesia Pasca-Orde Baru* (Jakarta-Yogyakarta: Puslitbang

Lektur, Khazanah Keagamaan, dan Manajemen Organisasi, Kemenag RI, 2019), 13–57.

⁵⁰ Muhammad Khoirul Muqtafa, “Citizenship in A Multi-Faith Society: A Case Study of Indonesia” (Deakin University, Australia, 2018).

⁵¹ Claudia Seise, “Islamic Authority Figures and Their Religioscapes in Indonesia,” *Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism* 10, no. 1 (2021): 37-58. <https://doi.org/10.21580/tos.v10i1.8441>

⁵² Aimie Sulaiman, “Memahami Teori Konstruksi Sosial Peter L. Berger,” *Jurnal Society* 6, no. 1 (2016): 15–22. DOI:[10.33019/society.v4i1.32](https://doi.org/10.33019/society.v4i1.32)

⁵³ Imam Subchi, Zulkifli, Rena Latifa & Sholikatus Sa’diyah, “Religious Moderation in Indonesian Muslims,” *MDPI: Religion* 13, no. 5 (2022): 2–11. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel13050451>

⁵⁴ Setinawati, Isabella Jeniva, Maidiantus Tanyid, Merilyn, “The framework of religious moderation: A socio-theological study on the role of religion and culture from Indonesia's perspective,” *Social Sciences & Humanities Open* 11, (2025): 101271, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssho.2024.101271>